

Evaluation of the Religious Moderation Workshop Using the Kirkpatrick Model at Bulukumba State Islamic Junior High School

Lenni Suriyanti¹, Sitti Mania², Muhammad Nur Akbar Rasyid³.

¹ Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar, Indonesia

² Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar, Indonesia

³ Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar, Indonesia

 email Lennisuriyanti90043@gmail.com

Abstract

The religious moderation workshop is one of the strategies developed by the Ministry of Religious Affairs to strengthen tolerance, national commitment, anti-violence, and respect for diversity in the madrasah environment. The effectiveness of the workshop implementation needs to be evaluated comprehensively to determine the extent to which the program is able to produce changes in participants. This study aims to evaluate the effectiveness of the religious moderation workshop at MTsN Bulukumba using the Kirkpatrick Evaluation Model which includes two levels: behavior and results. The study used a qualitative evaluative approach with data collection techniques through in-depth interviews and observations of workshop participants. Data analysis was carried out through data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions based on indicators at each Kirkpatrick evaluation level. The results show that at the behavior level, participants began to implement the values of moderation in the work environment through an attitude of mutual respect for differences of opinion, avoiding sensitive conversations, and preventing bullying practices. Meanwhile, at the results level, the workshop had a positive impact on the organizational culture of the madrasah in the form of increased respect for differences in educational, cultural, and social backgrounds, as well as the formation of more harmonious relationships with the community through strengthening tolerance. The religious moderation workshop at MTsN Bulukumba was deemed effective in increasing knowledge, changing behavior, and positively impacting the madrasah environment. This study recommends that training evaluation using the Kirkpatrick Model be implemented continuously to ensure the effectiveness of the program to strengthen religious moderation in madrasahs.

Keywords: Evaluation, Workshop, Religious Moderation, Kirkpatrick Model, Madrasah

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received
March 21, 2026
Revised
May 12, 2026
Accepted
June 30, 2026

Published by

Website

ISSN

Copyright



STAI Masjid Syuhada Yogyakarta

<https://journal.stainsy.ac.id/index.php/almanar/index>

2615-8879

This is an open access article under the CC BY SA license

<https://journal.stainsy.ac.id/index.php/almanar/index>

INTRODUCTION

Indonesia is a country with a high level of religious, ethnic, cultural, and linguistic diversity, necessitating the strengthening of values of tolerance and harmonious religious life. In recent years, the rise in intolerance, social polarization, and the spread of hate speech in digital spaces demonstrates that strengthening religious moderation remains a

strategic national need (Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, 2024; Susanto et al., 2024). Therefore, the government is mainstreaming religious moderation through various educational policies and programs, including in Islamic schools (madrasah) as institutions that play a crucial role in shaping students' religious character.

To implement this policy, the Ministry of Religious Affairs has held various religious moderation workshops for madrasah teachers with the aim of improving their competence in integrating the values of moderation into learning and school culture (Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, 2024). Teachers are positioned as the primary agents expected to instill values of tolerance, national commitment, anti-violence, and respect for local culture through daily learning practices. However, the success of the workshops cannot be measured solely by the implementation of the activities or the increase in participants' knowledge after the training. The effectiveness of training should be reflected in changes in teacher behavior in professional practice and its impact on learning and madrasah culture (Khaeroni, 2022; Darling-Hammond et al., 2022).

Evaluations of religious moderation workshops are still dominated by measuring participant satisfaction and knowledge gains during the training. However, the primary goal of teacher professional development is to generate sustainable behavioral changes and contribute to improving the quality of educational organizations. In this context, Kirkpatrick's New World Model offers a more comprehensive evaluation framework because it assesses training effectiveness through four levels: Reaction, Learning, Behavior, and Results (Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2022). This study focuses on the Behavior and Results levels because these two levels indicate the extent to which training outcomes are actually implemented in the workplace and impact the organization.

A review of previous research indicates a gap in research regarding the evaluation of religious moderation workshops. Research by Akhmadi and Tohari (2022) and Abdul Hamid et al. (2023) focused more on participant reactions and knowledge gains after the training. Khaeroni's (2022) study examined the implementation of religious moderation, but did not evaluate changes in teacher behavior or its impact on madrasah culture. Meanwhile, research by Alias, Sitti Mania, and Muhammad Nur Akbar Rasyid (2025) used the CIPP Model, which focuses on evaluating program implementation, not the effectiveness of training outcomes. To date, research specifically evaluating religious moderation workshops using Kirkpatrick's Level Behavior and Level Results Models for madrasah teachers remains very limited. This gap highlights the need for research that can provide empirical evidence regarding the workshop's success in generating changes in teacher professional practice and its impact on the madrasah environment.

Based on this description, this study aims to evaluate the effectiveness of religious moderation workshops for madrasah teachers using the Kirkpatrick Evaluation Model, focusing on Level Behavior and Level Results. This study has three novel features. First, it evaluates the workshop's success based on changes in teacher behavior and its impact on learning and madrasah culture, not solely on participant satisfaction or increased knowledge. Second, the study uses a qualitative evaluative approach to gain a deeper understanding of the process of internalizing religious moderation values in teachers' professional practice. Third, this study provides empirical evidence regarding the application of Level Behavior and Level Results in the evaluation of religious moderation workshops in madrasah settings, a relatively understudied area. The research findings are expected to enrich the development of training evaluation theory and serve as a basis for

refining policies and programs to strengthen religious moderation in Islamic educational settings.

METHOD

This study uses a qualitative approach with an evaluative research type, which aims to describe in depth the results level measuring the impact of the workshop on strengthening the culture of religious moderation, tolerance, and harmony among madrasa residents (Suaebah, Rasyid, & Mania, 2025). changes in participant behavior (behavior) and the impact of the program (results) the results level measures the impact of the workshop on strengthening the culture of religious moderation, tolerance, and harmony among madrasa residents (Suaebah, Rasyid, & Mania, 2025). after attending the religious moderation workshop. The qualitative approach was chosen because it is able to reveal the experiences, perceptions, and real practices of participants in implementing the training results in the work environment. In evaluation research, this approach allows researchers to gain a comprehensive understanding of the success of a program through exploration of behavior, context, and impacts, not just through numerical measurements (Malik Ibrahim, 2022; Creswell & Creswell, 2023). The evaluation framework used refers to the Kirkpatrick Model, with a focus on Level 3 (Behavior) and Level 4 (Results).

This research population included seven State Islamic Junior High Schools (MTsN) in Bulukumba Regency, which were the target of the religious moderation workshop. The study was not conducted on the entire population due to considerations of time efficiency, resource limitations, and the characteristics of qualitative research, which prioritizes depth of information over the number of research locations. Therefore, the study focused on one state Islamic junior high school (madrasah) selected purposively, considering that the madrasah had a sufficient number of workshop participants, actively implemented the religious moderation program, and provided comprehensive data access, thus representing the phenomenon under study. Focusing the research on a single location also allowed the researcher to conduct more intensive observations and obtain richer data, in line with the characteristics of qualitative research (Creswell & Creswell, 2023). The informants used in this study involved 22 respondents: 15 teachers as workshop participants, 1 madrasah principal, 2 colleagues, and 4 peers as data sources for the evaluation process.

Data collection was conducted through observation and in-depth interviews. Observations were used to observe the implementation of the religious moderation workshop results in the madrasah learning and environment. Interviews were conducted with the madrasah principal, participating teachers, and relevant parties to obtain information on behavioral changes and program impacts (results) based on the Kirkpatrick Evaluation Model. The integrated use of observations and interviews aimed to obtain comprehensive and credible data (Miskat et al., 2023; Alias, Mania, & Rasyid, 2025).

Data analysis used the interactive model of Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña, which includes data condensation, data presentation, and conclusion drawing. Data from interviews and observations were analyzed thematically based on Kirkpatrick Model Level 3 (Behavior) and Level 4 (Results) indicators to evaluate changes in participant behavior and the impact of the religious moderation workshop on the madrasah environment. The analysis was conducted systematically to provide a comprehensive overview of the program's effectiveness (Alias, Mania, & Rasyid, 2025).

Data validity was maintained through technical triangulation, comparing interview and observation results and conducting member checks with informants. This step aimed to ensure that the research findings aligned with field conditions, ensuring that the evaluation results were credible and accountable (Alias, Mania, & Rasyid, 2025).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

RESULT

Level 3 (Behavior): Changes in Participants' Behavior After Attending the Religious Moderation Workshop

Based on interviews with informants, it was found that the religious moderation workshop had resulted in positive behavioral changes in the participants' professional and social lives. These changes were evident in five behavioral indicators: national commitment, tolerance, non-violence, an accommodating attitude toward local culture, and a role as a moderating agent.

Regarding national commitment, interviews showed that informants viewed the religious moderation workshop as strengthening their awareness of the importance of maintaining unity in diversity. Teachers participating in the workshop stated that after participating in the activity, they gained a greater appreciation for differences in religion, ethnicity, culture, and social background within the madrasah environment. They believed that diversity was no longer viewed as a source of potential conflict, but rather as a national treasure that must be preserved through mutual respect, cooperation, and a spirit of unity. One MA teacher stated: "Through this workshop, I have come to understand more clearly that being different is permissible, but maintaining unity is a shared responsibility by respecting all differences, both within the madrasah environment and in society." This statement was reinforced by teacher IA, who stated: "After attending the workshop, I am more careful in my behavior and communication and strive to show respect to everyone, regardless of religion, ethnicity, or background." This finding was also confirmed by the madrasah principal, who stated: "After this workshop, the spirit of unity among teachers has become stronger, they increasingly respect differences of opinion, and they are able to serve as role models in instilling national values in the madrasah environment."

Based on the interview results, it can be concluded that the religious moderation workshop has encouraged participants to implement the values of national commitment in their daily interactions. This change is reflected in an increased awareness of maintaining unity, respecting diversity, and strengthening the spirit of nationalism as part of the implementation of religious moderation in the madrasah environment. These findings indicate that the workshop has encouraged participants to implement the values of national commitment in their daily social interactions.

Regarding the tolerance indicator, informants reported changes in how they respond to differences of opinion and beliefs. They admitted to being more respectful of others' views, and less easily making judgments or judging someone simply because of their religious background or different understanding. This attitude is reflected in the habit of listening to others' opinions first, respecting different religious practices and traditions, and prioritizing polite dialogue when differing views arise. This is as expressed by one DS teacher: "After attending the workshop, I realized that everyone has the right to have different opinions and beliefs. So I prefer to listen first, respect others' views, and discuss them in a respectful manner without imposing my own." Teacher AY also said: "This workshop taught me that differences are not meant to be debated, but understood. And I strive to respect friends who hold different views." This change was confirmed by a

colleague (AY), who stated: "I noticed that after attending the workshop, he is more open to receiving input and is less quick to blame others when differences of opinion arise. Discussions in the workplace have also become more polite and respectful." A similar sentiment was expressed by the madrasah principal: "There is a visible change in the teachers' attitudes after attending the workshop. They are more appreciative of differences, are able to build good communication with colleagues, and are role models in creating a harmonious and tolerant madrasah environment."

The researcher's observations also indicated behavioral changes that align with the interview results. During observations in the madrasah environment, the teachers participating in the workshop appeared to be building polite communication, giving colleagues the opportunity to express their opinions without interruption, and demonstrating mutual respect in meetings and school activities. Furthermore, no behavior leading to discrimination or discriminatory treatment of colleagues based on their religious background, culture, or views was observed. Interactions between teachers were harmonious and collaborative, reflecting the development of tolerance in the workplace.

The interview and observation findings indicate that the religious moderation workshop contributed to the growth of tolerance as part of the participants' behavioral changes after the training. These changes were not only felt by the participants but also observed by colleagues, madrasah leaders, and researchers through direct observations in the workplace. Regarding anti-violence, informants explained that they prioritize the principle of *tabayyun* (inquiry, or clarification) before believing or spreading information related to religious issues. They also expressed greater caution in responding to information that could potentially lead to conflict and strive to avoid all forms of bullying, both in the workplace and in their social lives. When differences of opinion arise, they prefer to resolve them through dialogue and deliberation rather than using confrontational methods. This was expressed by one of the teachers participating in the workshop: "After attending the workshop, I'm less likely to trust the information I receive, especially about religion. I first verify its accuracy before sharing it with others." Teacher AF echoed this sentiment, also stating: "This workshop has made me more cautious in my behavior. Now I try to watch my words, not easily believe or spread information that is unclear, and when problems arise, I prefer to resolve them through deliberation." This behavioral change was confirmed by a colleague who stated: "After attending the workshop, I noticed he was calmer in dealing with various issues. If there was information that was unclear, he always reminded us to verify it first. He also often reminded us to respect each other and not to bully." The madrasah principal also confirmed this change: "After the workshop, I saw teachers preferring dialogue when facing differences. They were also more careful in using social media and striving to create a safe, comfortable, and respectful school environment."

The researcher's observations supported these interview findings. During the observation process in the madrasah environment, teachers participating in the workshop appeared to resolve differences of opinion through polite discussion and deliberation without displaying emotional or confrontational attitudes. In various school activities, teachers were also seen reminding each other to verify information before disseminating it, especially information that could potentially cause misunderstandings or conflict. Furthermore, researchers did not find any bullying practices or actions leading to verbal violence during interactions between teachers or between teachers and students. The conducive work atmosphere, mutual respect, and prioritizing peaceful problem solving indicate that the anti-violence values learned through the workshop have begun to be

implemented in daily life in the madrasah environment. The interview findings and observation results indicate that the religious moderation workshop has shaped participants' behavioral tendencies to resolve conflicts peacefully through dialogue, apply the principle of *tabayyun* in responding to information, and reject all forms of violence and bullying in their professional and social lives.

Regarding the indicator of accommodating local culture, informants shared relatively similar views. They stated that respecting local culture does not necessarily mean having to follow or be directly involved in all existing traditions. According to them, as long as a tradition does not conflict with religious values, the attitude that needs to be prioritized is respecting the existence of that culture as part of the community's identity. Thus, respect for local culture is manifested through an attitude of mutual respect without having to eliminate religious beliefs or principles. This was expressed by one of the R teachers, "After attending the workshop, I understand more about the importance of respecting local culture. I don't have to follow all traditions, but I still respect them as long as they don't conflict with religious teachings." This was reinforced by teacher TF, "This workshop made me understand more that respecting culture doesn't mean having to follow all its traditions. What's important is that we continue to respect the community and maintain good relationships with everyone." This statement was reinforced by a colleague who said: "After attending the workshop, I saw that he has a greater appreciation for the community's culture and traditions. Even though he doesn't always participate in the activities, he still shows respect and never belittles them." A similar sentiment was expressed by the madrasah principal: "From what I've seen, after participating in the workshop, teachers are wiser in their approach to local culture. They encourage students to respect community traditions without neglecting religious values, so that both can exist in balance."

The researchers' observations also support these findings. During the observation process, teachers participating in the workshop appeared to demonstrate an attitude of respect for the cultural diversity that exists within the school and community. In various madrasah activities involving local cultural elements, teachers participated proportionally, respected the implementation of traditions that did not conflict with religious values, and did not display an attitude of belittling or rejecting the culture embraced by the surrounding community. The researchers also observed that teachers were able to explain to students the importance of preserving local culture as part of national identity, while still adhering to religious values. This attitude reflects the participants' ability to implement the value of religious moderation through respecting local culture wisely and proportionally. The interview findings and observations indicate that the religious moderation workshop encouraged participants to develop an accommodating attitude toward local culture. This attitude is manifested through respect for community traditions that do not conflict with religious teachings, thus fostering a harmonious life between religious values and local cultural wisdom.

Meanwhile, regarding their role as moderating agents, both informants revealed that they have strived to implement the values of religious moderation in their duties as educators. One form of implementation is creating a learning process that respects the diversity of religious backgrounds, ethnicities, cultures, and character of students in the classroom. Furthermore, they also provide students with an understanding of the importance of being wise in using social media, not being easily provoked by information whose veracity is uncertain, and not easily believing or spreading fake news (hoaxes) that have the potential to cause division. Teacher S expressed this, "After attending the

workshop, when teaching, I always remind students to respect each other, not to discriminate against friends, and to use social media wisely by verifying the accuracy of information before believing or sharing it." Teacher M also stated, "In teaching, I often encourage students to respect differences and resolve problems through dialogue, reminding them not to easily believe information whose veracity is uncertain to avoid misunderstandings or division."

This statement was reinforced by IA's colleague, who said: "From what I've seen, after attending the workshop, he more often links the lesson material to the values of religious tolerance and moderation. He also encourages students to respect differences and use social media more wisely." A similar sentiment was echoed by the madrasah principal: "From what I've seen, after attending the workshop, teachers have begun to act as agents of moderation in the madrasah. They not only teach, but also encourage students to respect differences, maintain unity, and be more discerning in filtering information on digital media."

The researcher's observations support these findings. During the learning process, the teachers participating in the workshop appeared to provide equal opportunities for all students to express their opinions regardless of their background. Teachers also integrated the values of religious moderation into the lessons through examples that emphasized the importance of tolerance, mutual respect, and coexistence in diversity. Furthermore, the researcher observed that teachers actively reminded students to use social media wisely, to verify the information they receive, and to avoid spreading unverified news. The interaction between teachers and students takes place in an inclusive, dialogical manner and reflects the role of teachers as role models in internalizing the values of religious moderation. The interview findings and observations indicate that participants not only understand the concept of religious moderation theoretically but have also implemented it in their learning practices and daily lives. The role of teachers as agents of moderation is reflected in their efforts to build an inclusive learning environment, instill tolerance, and equip students with critical thinking skills in responding to information in the digital age.

The interviews indicate that the religious moderation workshop has impacted the informants' behavior. These changes are evident in an increased commitment to national values, a growing sense of tolerance, a tendency to resolve conflicts peacefully through *tabayyun* (religious consultation) and dialogue, respect for local culture, and the emergence of an active role as agents of moderation through inclusive learning practices and digital literacy education for students. These findings are reinforced by the researchers' observations, which demonstrate the implementation of religious moderation values in daily activities within the madrasah environment. During the observations, teachers participating in the workshop appeared to communicate politely with colleagues and students, respect differences of opinion in various forums, prioritize deliberation in resolving problems, and refrain from discriminatory behavior or actions that lead to verbal violence. Teachers were also seen integrating the values of tolerance, respect for diversity, and wise use of social media into the learning process. Furthermore, interactions between teachers were harmonious, respectful, and reflected an inclusive work culture in accordance with the principles of religious moderation.

Thus, the interview findings, supported by observations, indicate that the lessons learned during the workshop were not only conceptually understood but also implemented in the context of participants' work and social lives. This demonstrates that

the religious moderation workshop successfully encouraged behavioral changes in participants, as indicated by indicators at the behavioral level in the Kirkpatrick Evaluation Model.

Level 4 (Results): Impact of the Religious Moderation Workshop

Based on interviews with informants, it was found that the religious moderation workshop not only resulted in changes in the participants' individual behavior but also had an impact on the work environment. This impact indicates that the values of religious moderation began to be implemented in various aspects of social interactions after the participants attended the workshop. Teacher M expressed this sentiment, "After attending the workshop, I am more careful in communicating with my coworkers. Even if there are differences of opinion, I prefer to discuss them peacefully rather than debate them." Teacher NS also stated, "This workshop made me more aware of the importance of maintaining good relationships in the workplace. Now I value my friends' opinions more and remind my coworkers not to bully, both in person and through social media."

This statement was reinforced by colleague N, who stated, "I noticed that after attending the workshop, he is more open to differences of opinion and prioritizes deliberation when problems arise. Relationships with his coworkers have also become more harmonious because communication is conducted with mutual respect." Another colleague also expressed: "The work atmosphere feels more comfortable. We are more careful in choosing topics of conversation to avoid misunderstandings, and if differences arise, we try to resolve them amicably without blaming each other." The madrasah principal echoed this sentiment: "I see positive changes in the teachers after participating in the workshop. They are better able to manage differences of opinion maturely, maintain healthy communication, and play an active role in creating a work environment that is mutually respectful, free from bullying, and conducive to collaboration."

The researchers' observations corroborated these findings. During the observation process within the madrasah, communication between teachers was observed to be polite, open, and respectful of differing opinions. In meetings and informal discussions, teachers gave colleagues the opportunity to express their views without interruption or condescension. When differences of opinion arose, they were resolved through deliberation and constructive dialogue. The researchers also did not observe any behavior that led to bullying, either verbally or nonverbally, during interactions between teachers. Furthermore, teachers appear to avoid discussing sensitive issues that could potentially trigger conflict and prioritize cooperation in completing school assignments. This reflects the creation of a harmonious, inclusive, and conducive work environment resulting from the implementation of religious moderation values.

The interview findings and observations indicate that the religious moderation workshop has had a positive impact on the work environment. This is evident in the improved quality of communication, the development of a culture of mutual respect, the strengthening of cooperation between teachers, and the creation of a safe, harmonious madrasah environment free from behaviors that could potentially lead to conflict. As teacher AF expressed, "After participating in the workshop, I feel the work atmosphere at the madrasah has become more open, with mutual respect despite our different educational backgrounds, cultures, and experiences. All teachers are given equal opportunities to express their opinions in every activity." Another participating teacher, AA, also stated: "This workshop has made us increasingly realize that diversity is a

strength for the madrasah. Now we work together more easily and no longer see differences as obstacles to carrying out our duties."

This statement was reinforced by a colleague, SR, who said: "I see relationships between teachers have improved. Everyone is more open to discussions, respects each other's opinions, and does not discriminate among colleagues based on educational or cultural background." SA's colleague also expressed: "The work atmosphere feels more cohesive now. Each teacher is given space to express ideas, and decisions are usually made through deliberation, so everyone feels valued." The madrasah principal also stated: "From what I've seen, after the workshop, the atmosphere at the madrasah has become more inclusive. Teachers respect each other more, work together without regard for differences, and are more actively involved in madrasah activities. As a result, teamwork also feels better."

The researcher's observations support these findings. During the observation process, it was clear that interactions between teachers were open and collaborative. In meetings and school activities, all teachers were given equal opportunities to express their opinions and participate in decision-making without any discrimination based on educational background, culture, age, or social status. The researcher also observed good cooperation in implementing madrasah programs, fair distribution of tasks, and respectful communication among the school community. The organizational climate demonstrates an inclusive character, where diversity is seen as a strength supporting the achievement of common goals, rather than as a source of differences that can trigger conflict.

The interview findings and observations indicate that the religious moderation workshop has had a positive impact on the organizational culture at MTsN Bulukumba. The values of religious moderation are not only understood by individuals but are also beginning to be internalized within the madrasah's work culture through increased mutual respect, collaboration among teachers, and participation. Regarding the impact on society, informants stated that they also apply the values learned during the workshop to their social lives. The most tangible form of implementation is the growth of a more tolerant attitude toward local culture, community traditions, and religious diversity. They reported being better able to respect differences without judging others' beliefs or cultural practices. Furthermore, both informants strive to avoid bullying, refrain from easily making negative judgments about others, and avoid discussions containing elements of ethnicity, religion, race, and intergroup relations (SARA), which could potentially lead to misunderstandings and social conflict. According to them, polite communication, mutual respect, and the ability to exercise restraint in addressing sensitive issues are concrete examples of the implementation of religious moderation in social life. This was expressed by Teacher M, "After attending the workshop, I have a greater appreciation for the traditions and culture of the community, as long as they don't conflict with religious teachings. I'm also more careful in my speech to avoid offending others or causing misunderstandings." Teacher R also said: "After attending the workshop, I understand more about the importance of maintaining harmony in the community. I'm also more careful in my speech, less judgmental, and strive to build good communication with all residents." This statement was reinforced by colleague N, who stated: "After attending the workshop, I see him being more open and respectful of differences when interacting with the community. He's also more careful in expressing his opinions to avoid misunderstandings."

A colleague (educational staff) from the madrasah also stated: "In community activities, he can get along with anyone regardless of background. He also shows a greater respect for differences and always encourages the community to maintain harmony." A similar sentiment was echoed by the madrasah principal: "From my observations, after participating in the workshop, teachers demonstrate a more moderate attitude, both at the madrasah and in the community. They are more likely to interact with various groups, respect differences, and strive to be role models in maintaining harmony." The researchers' observations further supported these findings. During the observation process, it was observed that the teachers participating in the workshop demonstrated politeness and respect for diversity when interacting with the school community and the community involved in madrasah activities. Teachers were able to communicate openly without bringing up issues that could potentially trigger conflict, respected cultural differences and social backgrounds, and did not exhibit discriminatory or demeaning behavior toward certain groups. The researchers also observed that teachers modeled ethical communication practices for students, avoided speech containing elements of ethnicity, religion, race, and intergroup relations, and built harmonious social relationships with various groups. This demonstrates that the values of religious moderation have been implemented not only within the madrasah environment but also in community life.

Interview findings, supported by observations, indicate that the religious moderation workshop has had a positive impact on participants' social lives in the community. This impact is characterized by increased tolerance of diversity, the development of polite communication, strengthened respect for local culture and differences in belief, and a reduction in behaviors that have the potential to cause social conflict. These findings indicate that the values of religious moderation learned during the workshop have been implemented effectively in community life, becoming one of the indicators of success at the results level in the Kirkpatrick Evaluation Model.

Interview results indicate that the religious moderation workshop has had a positive impact on various aspects of participants' lives. This impact is not only felt in changes in interpersonal relationships in the workplace but is also reflected in the development of a more inclusive organizational culture and improved quality of social interactions in the community. These findings indicate that the workshop's goal is not limited to increasing knowledge and changing individual behavior, but has had a broader impact on the environment in which participants carry out their professional and social roles. The researcher's observations also support these findings. During the observation process at the madrasah, changes were evident, reflected in more open communication patterns between teachers, increased cooperation in implementing various school activities, and the development of a culture of mutual respect regardless of educational background, culture, or social status. Teachers also demonstrated the ability to build harmonious relationships with students and the community through polite communication, respect for diversity, and resolving differences through dialogue and deliberation. Furthermore, researchers observed that the values of religious moderation were beginning to be integrated into learning activities, the madrasah work culture, and social interactions, creating a more inclusive, conducive, and collaborative environment.

Interview findings, supported by observations, indicate that the religious moderation workshop has made a positive contribution to the work environment, the organization, and the community. Based on the Level 4 (Results) perspective of the Kirkpatrick Evaluation Model, this workshop not only impacted individual quality but also

successfully fostered a harmonious work environment, an organizational culture that values diversity, and a more tolerant, inclusive community life that is able to manage differences peacefully. These findings indicate that the implementation of religious moderation values has gone beyond individual behavioral changes and has had a real impact on the environment in which participants carry out their professional and social roles.

DISCUSSION

The research results indicate that the religious moderation workshop at MTsN Bulukumba has produced tangible changes at the behavioral and outcome levels, according to the Kirkpatrick Evaluation Model. At the behavioral level, interviews revealed that teachers have begun implementing the values of religious moderation in their daily lives, such as strengthening their commitment to nationalism, increasing tolerance, prioritizing the principle of *tabayyun* (religious consensus) in responding to information, respecting local culture, and acting as agents of moderation through inclusive learning. These findings are supported by observations that demonstrate polite communication, resolving differences through deliberation, respect for diversity, and the integration of religious moderation values into the learning process. These findings align with Donald L. Kirkpatrick's view that the success of training at the behavioral level is demonstrated by participants' ability to consistently apply learning outcomes in the workplace.

These behavioral changes then have a broader impact at the outcome level. Based on interviews, the workshop contributed to the creation of a more harmonious work environment, the development of an inclusive organizational culture, and increased tolerance in society. Observations also revealed more open communication, improved collaboration between teachers, equal opportunities for participation, and more harmonious social relationships within the madrasah. These findings indicate that participants' implementation of moderate behavior has resulted in changes not only felt individually but also impacted the organization and the social environment.

These research findings align with the development of the New World Kirkpatrick Model proposed by James D. Kirkpatrick and Wendy Kayser Kirkpatrick, which emphasizes that behavioral change will have an organizational impact if supported by a conducive work environment and opportunities to implement training outcomes. In this study, this support was evident through the madrasah's collaborative work culture, leadership involvement, and supportive relationships between teachers, enabling the sustainable implementation of religious moderation values.

The relationship between behavior and outcomes indicates that changes in teacher behavior are a prerequisite for creating broader impacts on the work environment, organization, and society. The consistency between interview and observation results confirms that the religious moderation workshop not only increased participants' understanding but also resulted in behavioral changes that were implemented in practice and made a tangible contribution to strengthening the culture of religious moderation at MTsN Bulukumba. These findings confirm that the effectiveness of a training is not only measured by the increase in individual competencies, but also by the impact it has on the environment in which participants carry out their professional and social roles.

CONCLUSION

This research shows that the implementation of the religious moderation workshop at MTsN Bulukumba was effective based on two levels of the Kirkpatrick Evaluation Model: behavior and results. At the behavior level, the values of religious moderation began to be implemented in the participants' behavior through increased mutual respect, dialogical conflict resolution, the application of the principle of tabayyun (religious consultation), respect for local culture, and active roles as moderating agents in learning. Furthermore, at the results level, the workshop had a positive impact on the work environment, organizational culture, and community life, characterized by the creation of more harmonious communication, an inclusive and collaborative work culture, and increased tolerance in social interactions. These findings were reinforced through triangulation of interviews, observations, and documentation, demonstrating that the religious moderation workshop not only increased participants' knowledge but also resulted in behavioral changes and a tangible impact on the madrasah environment.

Based on the research findings, the implementation of religious moderation workshops needs to be carried out continuously with post-training mentoring to ensure the continued development of religious moderation values in educational practice. Madrasahs are also advised to integrate the values of religious moderation into their organizational culture, learning processes, and teacher professional development programs through reflection activities, learning communities, and ongoing training. Furthermore, program evaluations should be conducted periodically using the Kirkpatrick Model so that each level of program success can be systematically monitored and serve as a basis for future program improvements.

This study has several limitations. First, the study was conducted at only one madrasah, MTsN Bulukumba, so the results cannot be generalized to other madrasah contexts. Second, the number of informants was limited to five teacher workshop participants, five colleagues, and one madrasah principal, so the findings only reflect the conditions at the research location. Third, the evaluation at the results level was conducted within a relatively short timeframe after the workshop, thus not fully reflecting the long-term impact on the organization and society. Therefore, future research is recommended to involve more research locations, a more diverse number of informants, and conduct longitudinal evaluations to obtain a more comprehensive picture of the sustainability of the impact of the religious moderation workshop.

REFERENCE

- Abdullah, S., Mania, S., & Rasyid, M. N. A. (2025). Kirkpatrick's model as a framework for evaluating the Heart Enlightenment Program at Darul Mukhlisin Islamic Boarding School, Padang Lampe, UMI. *Jurnal Kajian Pendidikan dan Psikologi*, 3(2), 69–83. <https://doi.org/10.61397/jkpp.v3i2.457>
- Abrori, M. S., & Hadi, M. S. (2020). Integral Values in Madrasah: to Foster Community Trust in Education. *Istawa: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 5(2), 160. <https://doi.org/10.24269/ijpi.v5i2.2736>
- Akhmadi, A., & Tohari, K. (2022). Evaluasi pelatihan penggerak penguatan moderasi beragama di Jawa Timur. *Andragogi: Jurnal Diklat Teknis Pendidikan dan Keagamaan*, 10(1), 111–120. <https://doi.org/10.36052/andragogi.v10i1.290>
- Anderson, R. E., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J., & Hair, J. F. (2019). *Multivariate data analysis* (8th ed.). Cengage.
- Budihartono, B., Mania, S., & Rasyid, M. N. A. (2026). Penerapan model Kirkpatrick dalam mengukur efektivitas pembelajaran evaluasi program dan kebijakan pendidikan

- Islam. *Jurnal Pendidikan: Riset dan Konseptual*, 10(2), 358–369. https://doi.org/10.28926/riset_konseptual.v10i2.1480
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (5th ed.). Sage.
- Creswell, J. W., & Plano Clark, V. L. (2018). *Designing and conducting mixed methods research* (3rd ed.). Sage.
- Darling-Hammond, L., Hyler, M. E., & Gardner, M. (2022). *Effective teacher professional development*. Learning Policy Institute.
- Dinata, F. R., & Kuswadi, A. (2025). *Pengembangan Media Pembelajaran Interaktif Berbasis AI untuk Pembelajaran PAI di MI Roudhotu Tolibin Pisang Indah*. 1(2), 1–9.
- Fahmi Husein, Moh Solikul Hadi, E. K. (2024). *Strategi Digital Detox untuk Siswa : Efektivitas Pendidikan Islam melalui Program Bimbingan Konseling pada Anak SMA / SMK di Yogyakarta Penerbangan AAG Adisutjipto , penerapan strategi Digital Detox melalui program*. 13, 358–369.
- Fitzpatrick, J. L., Sanders, J. R., & Worthen, B. R. (2011). *Program evaluation: Alternative approaches and practical guidelines* (4th ed.). Pearson.
- Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia. (2019). *Moderasi beragama*. Badan Litbang dan Diklat Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia.
- Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia. (2023). *Moderasi beragama* (Edisi revisi). Badan Litbang dan Diklat Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia.
- Khaeroni. (2022). Peningkatan kompetensi profesional guru dalam bidang moderasi beragama melalui pelatihan di wilayah kerja (PDWK) dan pelatihan reguler. *Transformasi: Journal of Management, Administration, Education, and Religious Affairs*, 4(1), 1–23.
- Kirkpatrick, D. L., & Kirkpatrick, J. D. (2016). *Kirkpatrick's four levels of training evaluation* (3rd ed.). ATD Press.
- Kirkpatrick, J. D., & Kirkpatrick, W. K. (2019). *An introduction to the new world Kirkpatrick model*. ATD Press.
- Kirkpatrick, J. D., & Kirkpatrick, W. K. (2021). *Kirkpatrick's four levels of training evaluation*. ATD Press.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Sage.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (3rd ed.). Sage.
- Moh. Solikul Hadi, Alifia Azzahra Budi, Ali Kuswadi, F. R. D. (2025). *Utilization of the Learning Management System (LMS) Based on Edmodo in PAI Learning at the Indonesian School in Kuala Lumpur*. 7(2). <https://doi.org/10.25217/jrie.v7i1>.
- Moh. Solikul Hadi, Muhammad Nuril Anam, M. S. A. (2021). Reconstruction Of Martin Heidegger's Thinking Existentialism Model on Education inThe Industrial Era 4.0. *Journal of Research in Islamic Education*, 03(02), 47–58.
- Moh. Solikul Hadi, D. (2024). Efektifitas Instrumen Penilaian Pendidikan Agama Islam Untuk Meningkatkan Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis Dan Kreatif Peserta Didik Di Smk Muhammadiyah Mlati Yogyakarta. *Berkala Ilmiah Pendidikan*, 4(1), 28–34
- Moleong, L. J. (2021). *Metodologi penelitian kualitatif* (Edisi revisi). PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Noe, R. A. (2020). *Employee training and development* (8th ed.). McGraw-Hill Education.
- Peraturan Presiden Republik Indonesia Nomor 58 Tahun 2023 tentang Penguatan Moderasi Beragama. (2023). *Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia*.
- Phillips, J. J., & Phillips, P. P. (2016). *Handbook of training evaluation and measurement methods* (4th ed.). Routledge.
- Purwasetiawatik, T. F., Ibrahim, M. M., & Rasyid, M. N. A. (2024). Leadership training program at Faculty of Psychology, Bosowa University. *Journal La Edusci*, 5(5), 293–308. <https://doi.org/10.37899/journallaedusci.v5i5.1760>

- Rambe, P., Sabaruddin, & Maryam. (2022). Model moderasi beragama berbasis pesantren salaf: Studi kasus pada Madrasah Salafiyyah. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam Al-Thariqah*, 7(1), 157–168.
- Ramli, L., Rasyid, M. N. A., & Mania, S. (2025). Model Kirkpatrick dalam evaluasi program sosialisasi pembinaan Aparatur Sipil Negara (ASN) Kantor Kementerian Agama Kabupaten Mamasa. *Indo-MathEdu Intellectuals Journal*, 6(1), 1697–1708. <https://doi.org/10.54373/imeij.v6i1.2645>
- Rossi, P. H., Lipsey, M. W., & Henry, G. T. (2019). *Evaluation: A systematic approach* (8th ed.). Sage.
- Sekaran, U., & Bougie, R. (2020). *Research methods for business: A skill-building approach* (8th ed.). Wiley.
- Stufflebeam, D. L., & Coryn, C. L. S. (2014). *Evaluation theory, models, and applications* (2nd ed.). Jossey-Bass.
- Stufflebeam, D. L., & Zhang, G. (2021). *The CIPP evaluation model: How to evaluate for improvement and accountability*. Guilford Press.
- Suaebah, S., Rasyid, M. N. A., & Mania, S. (2025). Information and communication technology training program at BDK Makassar using Kirkpatrick's conceptual model. *Jurnal Kajian Pendidikan dan Psikologi*, 3(1), 64–78. <https://doi.org/10.61397/jkpp.v3i1.403>
- Sugiyono. (2023). *Metode penelitian kuantitatif, kualitatif, dan R&D*. Alfabeta.
- Yaqin, A., Syarif, M., & Rozi, S. (2023). Pendampingan penerapan pembelajaran moderasi beragama bagi guru pendidikan agama Islam di madrasah. *Ta'awun*, 3(2), 138–147.